

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
DRAFT RESOLUTION

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA APPROVING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL, PLN11-0272, FOR THE EXTERIOR ALTERATION OF A CONTRIBUTING STRUCTURE IN THE PARK STREET COMMERCIAL HISTORIC DISTRICT LOCATED AT 1518 PARK STREET.

WHEREAS, an application was made on August 29, 2011 to alter a contributor to a Historic District; and

WHEREAS, application was complete on August 29, 2011; and

WHEREAS, the public hearing for this application was opened and continued at the regular meeting of the Historic Advisory Board at its October 6, 2011 meeting; and

WHEREAS, the public hearing was continued at the December 1, 2011 meeting at the request of the applicant; and

WHEREAS, the public hearing was continued at the meeting of January 5, 2012; and

WHEREAS, the applicant met with city staff and reviewed possible options to meet the objectives of the project while considering the input given by the Historic Advisory Board; and

WHEREAS, after considering a number of options, the applicant determined that while the entry tile could be saved, no other modifications to the plans would meet with the project's objective; and

WHEREAS, the project was brought back to the Historical Advisory Board on February 2, 2012 for reconsideration by the Historic Advisory Board; and

WHEREAS, the General Plan designation is Community Commercial; and

WHEREAS, the Zoning classification is Community Commercial Theatre; and

WHEREAS, the proposal is Categorically Exempt Class 31 from CEQA, Guidelines, Section 15331 – Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to the Alameda Municipal Code 13-21.5; the Historical Advisory Board shall determine whether to issue a Certificate of Approval for repairs and

alterations of a Historical Monument or pre-1942 structure, with or without conditions of approval, based on whether plans and specifications meet the standards established by the Historical Advisory Board and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Board has made the following findings:

- 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.**

The current use of the subject property is not changing in this application.

- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.**

In this project, this finding speaks to the defining architectural features that comprise the Park Street Historical District. The subject property is one of the District's contributing buildings. While the store front glass and entry of 1518 Park Street will be modified, the overall architectural features of the building and the urban fabric of the streetscape will not be significantly altered. The polychromatic tile will remain, allowing visitors to continue to visualize the former clipped corner design. The brick column that currently delineates the corner will also remain generally intact. However, from a district-wide perspective, these alterations do not rise to the level of removing this building as a contributor to the District nor endanger the Park Street District's historical status.

- 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.**

In this project, this finding is referencing the Park Street Historical District as the property with the subject property being one of its many contributing buildings. As proposed, the proposed alterations will not cause a false sense of historical development to either the property or the District.

- 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.**

As proposed, this project shall not alter aspects of the District that have acquired historic significance in their own right.

5. **Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.**

In this project, this finding is referencing the Park Street Historical District as the property with the subject property being one of its many contributing buildings. Although the proposed alterations are removing some features of the subject property, they do not rise to the level as distinctive features, finishes and/or construction techniques of the District.

6. **Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.**

Should any remaining materials require repair during the project, the materials will be restored to match existing conditions.

7. **Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.**

No sandblasting, or chemical or physical surface cleaning of structure will occur.

8. **Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.**

No ground excavation is proposed at this location and no significant archeological resources are expected in this immediate location.

9. **New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.**

No proposed exterior alterations will rise to the level of eliminating this building's status as a contributing building nor destroy historic materials that characterize the Historic District. The proposed alterations are compatible in massing, size, scale with the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The project does not include additions and adjacent or related new construction therefore no construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda hereby grants Certificate of Approval, PLN11-0272 with the following conditions:

1. This Certificate of Approval shall terminate three (3) years from February 2, 2012, unless actual demolition under a valid building permit has begun.
2. The existing tile floor entry treatment will be retained unless it is deemed prohibited by the Chief Building Official.
3. Indemnification: The applicant, or its successors in interest, shall defend (with counsel reasonably acceptable to the City), indemnify, and hold harmless the City of Alameda and their respective agents, officers, and employees from any claim, action, or proceeding against the City of Alameda and their respective agents, officers or employees to attack, set aside, void or annul, any approval or related decision to this project. This indemnification shall include, but is not limited to, all damages, costs, expenses, attorney fees or expert witness fees arising out of or in connection with the project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and the City shall cooperate in such defense. The City may elect, in its sole discretion, to participate in the defense of said claim, action, or proceeding.
